

Top 5 Software Projects Scoring Criteria

Reviewers from the Software Technology Support Center (STSC), Hill Air Force Base, Utah, used the following criteria and point system to score all nominations as part of the process to select the 2002 U. S. Government's Top 5 Quality Software Project's finalists. Each nomination was awarded points (up to a maximum value) based on how well the project performed within each category: customer value, performance, technical value, and reviewer's discretion. At least three STSC consultants or engineers scored each nomination with the top one-third of the nominations closely scrutinized by the internal board to select the finalists.

Customer Value – Maximum 40 Points

Problem Reports

- Were responses to the problem reports and questions timely?

Value

- What was the measured value to the customer's mission (return on investment)?

Benefits and Satisfaction

- Is the end product useable?
- Is the customer satisfied with the end result?
- What other benefits were provided to the customer?
- Was the developer collaborative?
- Did the developer listen to the customer?
- Was the developer knowledgeable? Informative? Helpful?
- Was the developer professional in letting the customer know requirements trade-offs?

Performance – Maximum 25 Points

- Did the developer meet the contracted schedule?
- Did the developer meet the contracted budget?
- How many problem reports have been written against the product since system test?
- Is the customer satisfied with the performance?

Technical Value – Maximum 20 Points

- Was the problem challenging? How hard was this project to implement?
- Was the solution innovative? What approach was used to solve the problem? What technical value did they provide to the world?
- Is the project reusable? Can someone else use the end product, portions of the end product, code, process, or the product's technology to solve a future government problem?
- Is the project repeatable? Given a similar problem, could the group repeat this success or were they just lucky this time? (Did they use defined processes, trained people, etc.?)

Reviewer's Discretion – Maximum 15 Points

Use or don't use these points as discretion dictates. Suggested considerations include the following:

- Previous awards. (CMM, ISO 9000, Malcolm Baldrige, etc.)
- Customers. (Will one small organization use this or will it be dispersed worldwide?)
- Do they have measures that can be used for oversight and additional improvements?
- What is the atmosphere/morale of the developing organization?